P. "ENT COOPERATION TREA"

From the INTERNATIONAL BUREAU

PCT	То:
NOTIFICATION OF ELECTION (PCT Rule 61.2) Date of mailing (day/month/year)	Assistant Commissioner for Patents United States Patent and Trademark Office Box PCT Washington, D.C.20231 ETATS-UNIS D'AMERIQUE
28 August 2000 (28.08.00)	in its capacity as elected Office
International application No. PCT/IL99/00667	Applicant's or agent's file reference 36155
International filing date (day/month/year) 07 December 1999 (07.12.99)	Priority date (day/month/year) 07 December 1998 (07.12.98)
Applicant SLOVIN, Zvi	
1. The designated Office is hereby notified of its election made. X in the demand filed with the International Preliminar	y Examining Authority on: 07.07.00) national Bureau on:
The International Bureau of WIPO 34, chemin des Colombettes	Authorized officer Frédéric Rotsaert
1211 Geneva 20, Switzerland	Telephone No : (41,22) 338 83 38

PCT

WORLD INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY ORGANIZATION International Bureau



INTERNATIONAL APPLICATION PUBLISHED UNDER THE PATENT COOPERATION TREATY (PCT)

(51) International Patent Classification 7: H04Q 7/36			(11) International Publication Number:	WO 00/35222
		A1	(43) International Publication Date:	15 June 2000 (15.06.00)
(21) International Application Num	iber: PCT/IL	99/0066	(*=) = *** Builton 1:2, 1:2, 1:1:1,	
(22) International Filing Date:	7 December 1999 (0	07.12.9	AZ, BA, BB, BG, BR, BY, CA (Utility model), DE, DE (Utility model)	

IL

(71) Applicant (for all designated States except US): MARCONI COMMUNICATIONS ISRAEL LTD. [IL/IL]; 1 Hamelacha Street, Industrial Zone, 71293 Lod (IL).

7 December 1998 (07.12.98)

(72) Inventor; and

(30) Priority Data:

127436

- (75) Inventor/Applicant (for US only): SLOVIN, Zvi [IL/IL]; 41/10 Hanasi Harishon Street, 76303 Rehovot (IL).
- (74) Agent: COLB, Sanford, T.; Sanford T. Colb & Co., P.O. Box 2273, 76122 Rehovot (IL).

(81) Designated States: AE, AL, AM, AT, AT (Utility model), AU, AZ, BA, BB, BG, BR, BY, CA, CH, CN, CR, CU, CZ, CZ (Utility model), DE, DE (Utility model), DK, DK (Utility model), DM, EE, EE (Utility model), ES, FI, FI (Utility model), GB, GD, GE, GH, GM, HR, HU, ID, IL, IN, IS, JP, KE, KG, KP, KR, KZ, LC, LK, LR, LS, LT, LU, LV, MA, MD, MG, MK, MN, MW, MX, NO, NZ, PL, PT, RO, RU, SD, SE, SG, SI, SK, SK (Utility model), SL, TJ, TM, TR, TT, TZ, UA, UG, US, UZ, VN, YU, ZA, ZW, ARIPO patent (GH, GM, KE, LS, MW, SD, SL, SZ, TZ, UG, ZW), Eurasian patent (AM, AZ, BY, KG, KZ, MD, RU, TJ, TM), European patent (AT, BE, CH, CY, DE, DK, ES, FI, FR, GB, GR, IE, IT, LU, MC, NL, PT, SE), OAPI patent (BF, BJ, CF, CG, CI, CM, GA, GN, GW, ML, MR, NE, SN, TD, TG).

Published

With international search report.

(54) Title: APPARATUS AND METHODS FOR CHANNEL ALLOCATION

(57) Abstract

This invention discloses a method for utilization of a first plurality of channels by a second plurality of transmitters, the method includes the steps of defining a third plurality of transmitter subsets such that at least one of the second plurality of transmitters is included in each transmitter subset; assigning at least one channel from among the first plurality of channels to each transmitter subset, to be shared among the transmitters in that transmitter subset, such that less than all of the first plurality of channels are assigned to the third plurality of transmitter subsets, thereby defining a reservoir of channels which have not been assigned to any transmitter subset, and sharing the channels in the reservoir of channels between all of the second plurality of transmitters. A system for utilization of a first plurality of channels by a second plurality of transmitters is also disclosed.

FOR THE PURPOSES OF INFORMATION ONLY

Codes used to identify States party to the PCT on the front pages of pamphlets publishing international applications under the PCT.

AL	Albania	ES	Spain	LS	Lesotho	SI	Slovenia
AM	Armenia	FI	Finland	LT	Lithuania	SK	Slovakia
ΑT	Austria	FR	France	LU	Luxembourg	SN	Senegal
ΑU	Australia	GA	Gabon	LV	Latvia	SZ	Swaziland
ΑZ	Azerbaijan	GB	United Kingdom	MC	Monaco	TD	Chad
BA	Bosnia and Herzegovina	GE	Georgia	MD	Republic of Moldova	TG	Togo
BB	Barbados	GH	Ghana	MG	Madagascar	ТJ	Tajikistan
BE	Belgium	GN	Guinea	MK	The former Yugoslav	TM	Turkmenistan
BF	Burkina Faso	GR	Greece		Republic of Macedonia	TR	Turkey
BG	Bulgaria	HU	Hungary	ML	Mali	TT	Trinidad and Tobago
BJ	Benin	IE	Ireland	MN	Mongolia	ÜA	Ukraine
BR	Brazil	IL	Israel	MR	Mauritania	UG	Uganda
BY	Belarus	IS	Iceland	MW	Malawi	US	United States of America
CA	Canada	IT	Italy	MX	Mexico	UZ	Uzbekistan
CF	Central African Republic	JP	Japan	NE	Niger	VN	Vict Nam
CG	Congo	KE	Kenya	NL	Netherlands	YU	Yugoslavia
CH	Switzerland	KG	Kyrgyzstan	NO	Norway	zw	Zimbabwe
CI	Côte d'Ivoire	KP	Democratic People's	NZ	New Zealand	211	Zimbabwe
CM	Cameroon		Republic of Korea	PL	Poland		
CN	China	KR	Republic of Korea	PT	Portugal		
CU	Cuba	KZ	Kazakstan	RO	Romania		
CZ	Czech Republic	LC	Saint Lucia	RU	Russian Federation		
DE	Germany	LI	Liechtenstein	SD	Sudan		
DK	Denmark	LK	Sri Lanka	SE	Sweden		
EE	Estonia	LR	Liberia	SG	Singapore		
							



(PCT Article 18 and Rules 43 and 44)

Applicant's or agent's file reference 36155	FOR FURTHER see Notification o (Form PCT/ISA/2:	f Transmittal of International Search Report 20) as well as, where applicable, item 5 below.			
International application No.	International filing date (day/month/year)	(Earliest) Priority Date (day/month/year)			
PCT/IL 99/00667	07/12/1999	07/12/1998			
Applicant					
MARCONI COMMUNICATIONS IS	RAEL LTD. et al.				
This International Search Report has been according to Article 18. A copy is being tra	n prepared by this International Searching Auth	ority and is transmitted to the applicant			
This International Search Report consists X It is also accompanied by	of a total of3 sheets. a copy of each prior art document cited in this	report.			
	international search was carried out on the bas	is of the international application in the			
the international search w Authority (Rule 23.1(b)).	as carried out on the basis of a translation of the	ne international application furnished to this			
b. With regard to any nucleotide an was carried out on the basis of the		ternational application, the international search			
contained in the internation	onal application in written form.				
filed together with the inte	rnational application in computer readable forn	1.			
	this Authority in written form.				
	this Authority in computer readble form.				
	sequently furnished written sequence listing do s filed has been furnished.	bes not go beyond the disclosure in the			
the statement that the info furnished	ormation recorded in computer readable form is	identical to the written sequence listing has been			
2. Certain claims were fou	nd unsearchable (See Box I).				
3. Unity of invention is lac	king (see Box II).				
4. With regard to the title,					
X the text is approved as su	bmitted by the applicant.				
the text has been established by this Authority to read as follows:					
	bmitted by the applicant. hed, according to Rule 38.2(b), by this Authorit e date of mailing of this international search rep				
6. The figure of the drawings to be published with the abstract is Figure No.					
as suggested by the appli		None of the figures.			
because the applicant failed to suggest a figure.					
because this figure better	characterizes the invention.				

 \cdot^{j}



International	Application No
IL	99/00667

A. CLASSIFICATION OF SUBJECT MATTER IPC 7 H0407/36

According to International Patent Classification (IPC) or to both national classification and IPC

B. FIELDS SEARCHED

Minimum documentation searched (classification system followed by classification symbols) IPC $7 \quad H04Q$

Documentation searched other than minimum documentation to the extent that such documents are included in the fields searched

Electronic data base consulted during the international search (name of data base and, where practical, search terms used)

C. DOCUM	ENTS CONSIDERED TO BE RELEVANT	
Category °	Citation of document, with indication, where appropriate, of the relevant passages	Relevant to claim No.
A	EP 0 876 074 A (NORTHERN TELECOM LTD.) 4 November 1998 (1998-11-04) abstract; figures 10-12 column 5, line 37 - line 57	1,3,12
Α	WO 95 16332 A (BRITISH TELECOMMUNICATIONS PLC.) 15 June 1995 (1995-06-15) abstract; figures 3-5 page 9, line 4 -page 10, line 26	1
Α	WO 97 32440 A (TELEFONAKTIEBOLAGET LM ERICSSON) 4 September 1997 (1997-09-04) abstract; claim 1	1,2
Α	US 5 844 894 A (DENT) 1 December 1998 (1998-12-01) abstract; figures 6B-8B column 9, line 54 -column 10, line 18	4-7

Further documents are listed in the continuation of box C.	Patent family members are listed in annex.
 Special categories of cited documents: "A" document defining the general state of the art which is not considered to be of particular relevance "E" earlier document but published on or after the international filling date "L" document which may throw doubts on priority claim(s) or which is cited to establish the publication date of another citation or other special reason (as specified) "O" document referring to an oral disclosure, use, exhibition or other means "P" document published prior to the international filing date but later than the priority date claimed 	"T" later document published after the international filing date or priority date and not in conflict with the application but cited to understand the principle or theory underlying the invention "X" document of particular relevance; the claimed invention cannot be considered novel or cannot be considered to involve an inventive step when the document is taken alone "Y" document of particular relevance; the claimed invention cannot be considered to involve an inventive step when the document is combined with one or more other such documents, such combined with one or more other such documents, such combination being obvious to a person skilled in the art. "&" document member of the same patent family
Date of the actual completion of the international search	Date of mailing of the international search report
7 March 2000	14/03/2000
Name and mailing address of the ISA	Authorized officer
European Patent Office, P.B. 5818 Patentlaan 2 NL - 2280 HV Rijswijk Tel. (+31-70) 340-2040, Tx. 31 651 epo nl, Fax: (+31-70) 340-3016	Danielidis, S

1



International Application No
IL 99/00667

C.(Continua	tion) DOCUMENTS CONSIDERED TO BE RELEVANT	
Category °	Citation of document, with indication, where appropriate, of the relevant passages	Relevant to claim No.
A	DUQUE-ANTON ET AL.: "Channel Assignment for cellular Radio Using Simulated Annealing" IEEE TRANSACTIONS ON VEHICULAR TECHNOLOGY, vol. 42, no. 1, February 1993 (1993-02), pages 14-21, XP000363395 USA cited in the application the whole document	1
A	KATZELA ET AL.: "Channel Assignment Schemes for Cellular Mobile Telecommunication Systems: A Comprehensive Survey" IEEE PERSONAL COMMUNICATIONS, vol. 3, no. 3, 1 June 1996 (1996-06-01), pages 10-31, XP000593925 USA the whole document	1
		·

1

nto on patent family members

International Application No

Patent document cited in search repo	rt	Publication date		atent family member(s)	Publication date
EP 876074	Α	04-11-1998	BR CA	9801538 A 2236515 A	18-05-1999 02-11-1998
WO 9516332	A	15-06-1995	AU AU CA CN EP JP SG	686698 B 1116195 A 2176832 A 1136878 A 0733297 A 2878456 B 47764 A	12-02-1998 27-06-1995 15-06-1995 27-11-1996 25-09-1996 05-04-1999 17-04-1998
WO 9732440	Α	04-09-1997	AU	2108597 A	16-09-1997
US 5844894	Α	01-12-1998	AU WO	1971597 A 9732441 A	16-09-1997 04-09-1997

Om



PCT

REC'D	20	MAR	2001
WPO			POT

INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY EXAMINATION REPORT

(PCT Article 36 and Rule 70)

Applicant's or agent's file reference		See Notific	cation of Transmittal of International	
BO 43769	FOR FURTHER ACTION Preliminary Examination Report (Form PCT/I			
International application No. International filing date (ay/month/year)	Priority date (day/month/year)	
PCT/IL99/00667	07/12/1999		07/12/1998	
International Patent Classification (IPC H04Q7/36	or national classification and IPC			
Applicant				
MARCONI COMMUNICATION	S ISRAEL LTD. et al.			
This international preliminary and is transmitted to the appli		repared by this Int	ernational Preliminary Examining Authority	
2. This REPORT consists of a to	otal of 8 sheets, including this	cover sheet.		
been amended and are th	panied by ANNEXES, i.e. sheen ne basis for this report and/or s ion 607 of the Administrative l	heets containing re	on, claims and/or drawings which have ectifications made before this Authority he PCT).	
These annexes consist of a to	otal of sheets.			
This report contains indication	s relating to the following item	s:		
I ⊠ Basis of the repo	t			
II □ Priority				
III Non-establishmei	nt of opinion with regard to nov	elty, inventive step	and industrial applicability	
IV □ Lack of unity of in	vention			
	ent under Article 35(2) with reganations suporting such stater		ventive step or industrial applicability;	
VI ☐ Certain documer	nts cited			
VII 🖾 Certain defects in	the international application			
VIII Certain observations on the international application				
	T	Data of a second of	A Abic years	
Date of submission of the demand		Date of completion of	ir this report	
07/07/2000		15.03.2001		
Name and mailing address of the interpreliminary examining authority:	national	Authorized officer	Suppose Suppos	
European Patent Office D-80298 Munich Tel. +49 89 2399 - 0 Tx:	523656 epmu d	Möll, H-P	(Lase 25) of the state of the s	
Fax: +49 89 2399 - 4465		Telephone No. +49 8	39 2399 8243	



INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY EXAMINATION REPORT

International application No. PCT/IL99/00667

l. Basis o	f the report
------------	--------------

1.	This report has been drawn on the basis of (substitute sheets which have been furnished to the receiving Office in response to an invitation under Article 14 are referred to in this report as "originally filed" and are not annexed to the report since they do not contain amendments (Rules 70.16 and 70.17).): Description, pages:							
	1-62	2	as originally filed					
	Claims, No.:							
	1-12	2	as originally filed					
	Drawings, sheets:							
	1/30)-30/30	as originally filed					
2.	With regard to the language , all the elements marked above were available or furnished to this Authority in the language in which the international application was filed, unless otherwise indicated under this item.							
	These elements were available or furnished to this Authority in the following language: , which is:							
	☐ the language of a translation furnished for the purposes of the international search (under Rule 23.1(b)).							
	the language of a translation furnished for the purposes of international preliminary examination (under Rule 55.2 and/or 55.3).							
3.	. With regard to any nucleotide and/or amino acid sequence disclosed in the international application, the international preliminary examination was carried out on the basis of the sequence listing:							
		contained in the ir	nternational application in written form.					
	filed together with the international application in computer readable form.							
	furnished subsequently to this Authority in written form.							
	☐ furnished subsequently to this Authority in computer readable form.							
	☐ The statement that the subsequently furnished written sequence listing does not go beyond the disclosure in the international application as filed has been furnished.							
	☐ The statement that the information recorded in computer readable form is identical to the written sequence listing has been furnished.							
4.	. The amendments have resulted in the cancellation of:							
		the description,	pages:					
		the claims,	Nos.:					



INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY EXAMINATION REPORT

International application No. PCT/IL99/00667

		the drawings,	sheets:					
5.	☐ This report has been established as if (some of) the amendments had not been made, since they have been considered to go beyond the disclosure as filed (Rule 70.2(c)):							
		(Any replacement she report.)	eet contair	ning such	amendments must be referred to under item 1 and annexed to this			
6.	Add	litional observations, if	necessar	y:				
V.	. Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement							
1.	Statement							
	Nov	velty (N)	Yes: No:	Claims Claims	1-12			
	Inve	entive step (IS)	Yes: No:	Claims Claims	1-12			
	Indu	ustrial applicability (IA)	Yes: No:	Claims Claims	1-12			

2. Citations and explanations see separate sheet

VII. Certain defects in the international application

The following defects in the form or contents of the international application have been noted: see separate sheet

VIII. Certain observations on the international application

The following observations on the clarity of the claims, description, and drawings or on the question whether the claims are fully supported by the description, are made: see separate sheet

₹

INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY **EXAMINATION REPORT - SEPARATE SHEET**

Cited Documents

Reference is made to the following document (D1) in this International Preliminary 1. **Examination Report:**

D1: "Channel Assignment Schemes for Cellular Mobile Telecommunication Systems: A Comprehensive Survey",

I. Katzela et al.

IEEE Personal Communications, vol. 3, no. 3, 01.06.1996, pages 10-31

Re Item V

Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement

- Article 33(2) PCT, Novelty: 1.
- 1.1 Claims 1 and 12:

None of the cited prior art references discloses all of the features of the subject-matter of independent Claims 1 and 12 which therefore meet the requirements of Article 33(2) PCT regarding novelty.

1.2 Claims 2 and 4-11:

As a consequence, Claims 2 and 4-11, as being directly or indirectly dependent on Claim 1, also meet the requirements of Article 33 (2) PCT regarding novelty.

1.3 Claim 3:

The subject-matter of independent Claim 3 essentially corresponds to the features of independent Claim 1 and does therefore also meet the requirements of Article 33(2) PCT regarding novelty.

- Article 33(3) PCT, Inventive Step: 2.
- 2.1 Claims 1 and 12:
- The document **D1** is regarded as being the closest prior art to the subject-matter (a) of independent method Claim 1 and corresponding independent system Claim 12, and shows a "method/system for utilization of a plurality of [...] channels by a [...] plurality of transmitters" with the following features defined in Claims 1 and 12



of the present invention:

- assigning at least one channel from among the first plurality of channels [...], to be shared among the transmitters [...], such that less than all of the first plurality of channels are assigned [...] (D1, page 21, left column, "fixed set", see the first eight lines of the paragraph dealing with "HCA" for reference) thereby defining a reservoir of channels which have not been assigned [...]; (D1, page 21, left column. "dynamic set", see lines 8/9 of the paragraph dealing with "HCA" for reference) and
- sharing the channels in the reservoir of channels between all of the second plurality of transmitters (D1, page 21, left column, "dynamic set", see lines 9-11 of the paragraph dealing with "HCA" for reference).
- The method respectively system defined in present Claims 1 and 12 differ from (b) the disclosure of document D1 only in that D1 does not explicitly show that a plurality of transmitter subsets is defined, such that at least one of the second plurality of transmitters is included in each transmitter subset.
- Considering the fact, however, that it represents a well-known measure in prior art (c) telecommunications systems to group transmitters (i.e. "cells") in transmitter subsets (i.e. "clusters") to allow frequency re-use (or channel re-use) and that the present International Application does not specify the step of defining transmitter subsets with any further technical features showing any contribution to the prior art, it follows that the above-mentioned feature of present Claims 1 and 12 does not add anything of inventive significance to the features that are explicitly disclosed in D1 (see point 2.1(a)) and that therefore the subject-matter of Claims 1 and 12 does not meet the requirements of Article 33(3) PCT.

2.2 Claim 3:

The subject-matter of independent Claim 3 essentially corresponds to the (a) features of independent Claim 1 and does therefore not add any new substantive technical features.

As already outlined under points 2.1(a)-2.1(c) above, document D1 obviously

₹

discloses selecting channels from a fixed or a dynamic set depending on their availability (D1, page 21, left column, "fixed and dynamic sets", see lines 1-11 of the paragraph dealing with "HCA" for reference).

Independent Claim 3 does therefore also not meet the requirements of Article 33(3) PCT.

2.3 Claims 2 and 4-11:

Dependent Claims 2 and 4-11 do not contain any features which, in combination (a) with the subject-matter of the Claims to which they are appended, meet the requirements of the PCT in respect of inventive step (Article 33(3) PCT), as the additional features introduced by said dependent claims refer only to minor implementing details which are disclosed or directly derivable from the cited prior art references or fall within the general knowledge or technical competence of a person skilled in the art.

only concerns a minor implementing detail, as it is considered Claim 2:

> well-known in the field of cellular frequency planning to apply a certain "frequency re-use distance" when assigning the same

frequency to different cells

D1, page 10, right column, see lines 1-11 of the paragraph Claims 4-7:

dealing with "Channel Allocation Schemes" for reference

only concern minor implementing details Claims 8-11:

Re Item VII

Certain defects in the international application

Reference Signs: 1.

According to the requirements of Rule 11.13(I) reference signs not appearing in the description shall not appear in the drawings, and vice versa. This requirement is not met in view of the reference signs "400, 420" in Fig.21 (see description on page 17), "510, 520" in Fig.22 (see description on page 17), "600, ,620, 630" in Fig.23 (see description on page 17), "800, 810, 820, 840, 850, 860, 880" in Fig.25 (see description on page 17) and "900, 910, 920, 930, 940" (see description on page 17/18). All said reference signs should have been added to the description



EXAMINATION REPORT - SEPARATE SHEET

on pages 17/18.

- 2. Channels "E" and "F" should have been removed from the "Local reservoir of Subset III" in Fig.17a according to the description on page 15.
- 3. The graphs shown in Figs. 5 and 6 that are intended to show the relationships between **subsets I-VI** are incomplete compared to the description and to Figs. 7a-7f. The nodes shown in Figs. 5 and 6 should therefore have been filled with the corresponding **subset numbers I-VI**.
- 4. To meet the requirements of Rule 5.1.(a) (ii) PCT, the relevant background art disclosed in the document **D1** cited in the <u>International Search Report</u> should have been mentioned in the description and these documents should have been identified therein.
- 5. The independent claims should have been cast in the proper two-part form in accordance with Rule 6.3(b) PCT with those features known in combination from the nearest prior art document **D1** being placed in a *preamble* (Rule 6.3(b)(i) PCT) and with the remaining features being included in a *characterising part* (Rule 6.3(b)(ii) PCT).
- 6. In the introductory part of the description, the statements indicating the <u>technical</u> <u>problem</u> to be solved should have been revised with reference to the relevant prior art document **D1** cited above (Rule 5.1 (a) (iii) PCT).
- 7. The "incorporated by reference" statement on page 1 just preceding the paragraph starting with the "Summary of the invention" should have been deleted, since the application should be self-contained (PCT International Preliminary Examination Guidelines, Chapter II, 4.17).

Re Item VIII

Certain observations on the international application

1. The various definitions of the invention given in the **three independent Claims**, i.e. the two independent **Claims 1 and 3** in the <u>method category</u> and the <u>system</u>

INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY **EXAMINATION REPORT - SEPARATE SHEET**

International application No. PCT/IL99/00667

(apparatus) Claim 12 corresponding to Claim 1, which are of similar or at least overlapping scope, are such that the Claims as a whole are not clear and

concise, contrary to the requirements of Article 6 PCT.

Indeed, the subject matter represented in these different independent Claims overlaps to such an extent that they could have easily been formulated as a single independent claim in each of the system (apparatus) and method category comprising all the features that are essential to the definition of the invention and dependent claims as appropriate (see Rule 6.1(a) PCT and the PCT International Preliminary Examination Guidelines, Chapter III, 5.1).

Dependent Claim 11 does not meet the requirements regarding clarity following 2. from Article 6 PCT for the following reasons:

The term "dropout transmitter" and the step of "releasing a dropout transmitter" as used in Claim 11 are totally unclear and undefined. Even the description does not appear to provide any support. The subject-matter of Claim 11 thus leaves the reader in doubt as to the scope of protection that the applicant desires.